

THE GHIRLANDA-GUERRA IDENTITIES WITHOUT AVERAGING

SOURAV CHATTERJEE

ABSTRACT. The Ghirlanda-Guerra identities are one of the most mysterious features of spin glasses. We prove the GG identities in a large class of models that includes the Edwards-Anderson model, the random field Ising model, and the Sherrington-Kirkpatrick model in the presence of a random external field. Previously, the GG identities were rigorously proved only ‘on average’ over a range of temperatures or under small perturbations.

1. INTRODUCTION

Consider the Sherrington-Kirkpatrick model of spin glasses [11] in the presence of an external field, defined as follows. Let N be a positive integer. Let $(g_{ij})_{1 \leq i < j \leq N}$ and $(g_i)_{1 \leq i \leq N}$ be collections of i.i.d. standard Gaussian random variables. Fix three real numbers β, γ, h . Define a Hamiltonian H_N on $\{-1, 1\}^N$ as

$$-H_N(\sigma) := \frac{\beta}{\sqrt{N}} \sum_{1 \leq i < j \leq N} g_{ij} \sigma_i \sigma_j + h \sum_{1 \leq i \leq N} \sigma_i + \gamma \sum_{1 \leq i \leq N} g_i \sigma_i.$$

Let G_N be the (random) probability measure on $\{-1, 1\}^N$ that puts mass

$$G_N(\{\sigma\}) \propto e^{-H_N(\sigma)}$$

at each configuration σ . This is the Gibbs measure of the SK model. As usual, for a function $f : (\{-1, 1\}^N)^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ we write

$$\langle f \rangle := \sum_{\sigma^1, \dots, \sigma^n} f(\sigma^1, \dots, \sigma^n) G_N(\{\sigma^1\}) \cdots G_N(\{\sigma^n\}).$$

Following the notation in Talagrand [12], we write

$$\nu(f) := \mathbb{E} \langle f \rangle.$$

Date: November 18, 2009.

2000 Mathematics Subject Classification. 60K35, 82B44.

Key words and phrases. Ghirlanda-Guerra identities, spin glass, Sherrington-Kirkpatrick model.

The author’s research was supported in part by NSF grant DMS 0707054 and a Sloan Research Fellowship.

Let $\sigma^1, \sigma^2, \dots$ be i.i.d. configurations from the Gibbs measure. In the spin glass parlance, these are known as replicas. The overlap between two replicas σ^ℓ and $\sigma^{\ell'}$ is defined as

$$R_{\ell, \ell'} := \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N \sigma_i^\ell \sigma_i^{\ell'}.$$

Now fix a number n , and a bounded measurable function $f : \mathbb{R}^{n(n-1)/2} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$. Let $\mathcal{R}_n$ denote the collection $(R_{\ell, \ell'})_{1 \leq \ell < \ell' \leq n}$. Writing $f = f(\mathcal{R}_n)$ for simplicity, let

$$(1) \quad \delta_N(\beta, \gamma, h) := \nu(R_{1, n+1} f) - \frac{1}{n} \nu(R_{1, 2}) \nu(f) - \frac{1}{n} \sum_{2 \leq \ell \leq n} \nu(R_{1, \ell} f).$$

The Ghirlanda-Guerra identities [7] claim that for any such n and f , for almost all β, γ, h ,

$$(2) \quad \lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \delta_N(\beta, \gamma, h) = 0.$$

There is an extended form of the GG identities that claims more: in the infinite volume limit, the conditional distribution of $R_{1, n+1}$ given $\mathcal{R}_n$ is

$$\frac{1}{n} \mathcal{L}_{R_{1, 2}} + \frac{1}{n} \sum_{2 \leq \ell \leq n} \delta_{R_{1, \ell}},$$

where $\mathcal{L}_{R_{1, 2}}$ is the (unconditional) law of $R_{1, 2}$, and $\delta_{R_{1, \ell}}$ is the point mass at $R_{1, \ell}$. Clearly, (2) is a special case of this extended version.

There is an early version of the GG identities that are sometimes called the Aizenman-Contucci identities; these appeared in [1]. The paper [1] also introduced the important notion of stochastic stability in spin glass models. An interesting connection between stochastic stability and the GG identities was discovered by Arguin [2].

The importance of the GG identities stems from their universal nature. The identities are supposed to hold in a wide array of spin glass models, both mean field and short range. A striking recent discovery of Panchenko [9], following on the insightful work of Arguin and Aizenman [3], indicates that the GG identities may actually solve the long-standing mystery of ultrametricity in spin glasses.

It is not difficult to show (see e.g. Talagrand [12], Section 2.12) that for any $a > 0$, and any β, h ,

$$(3) \quad \lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \int_{-a}^a |\delta_N(\beta, x, h)| dx = 0.$$

Similar results were proved for a general class of spin glass models, including the short range Edwards-Anderson model, by Contucci and Giardinà [5]. However, this does not prove (2). The best advance till date is due to Talagrand [13] who showed that for any β, γ, h , there exists a sequence

$\gamma_N \rightarrow \gamma$ such that

$$\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \delta_N(\beta, \gamma_N, h) = 0.$$

Let ψ_N be the free energy per particle, defined as

$$\psi_N := \frac{1}{N} \log \sum_{\sigma} e^{-H_N(\sigma)}.$$

Let $p_N = p_N(\beta, \gamma, h) := \mathbb{E}(\psi_N)$. As easy extension of the Guerra-Toninelli argument [8] shows that $\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} p_N(\beta, \gamma, h)$ exists for all β, γ, h . Let us call this limit $p(\beta, \gamma, h)$. Then p is a convex function of each argument.

Theorem 1.1. *Suppose p is differentiable in γ at a certain value of (β, γ, h) , where $\gamma \neq 0$. Then at this value the Ghirlanda-Guerra identities hold, that is, $\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \delta_N(\beta, \gamma, h) = 0$.*

Clearly, the major drawback of the above result is that it only works for $\gamma \neq 0$. This is problematic since $\gamma = 0$ is the most interesting case. A minor drawback is that the theorem holds for almost every value of γ instead of all values. But this is not a serious problem since it is not clear whether the GG identities hold at points of phase transition, and the original paper of Ghirlanda and Guerra [7] does not make such a claim either. And lastly, it will be an important breakthrough if one can prove a similar statement for the extended GG identities, but that seems to be out of reach at present.

The proof of Theorem 1.1 admits a vast generalization, which we state below.

For each N , suppose μ_N is a probability measure on $\{-1, 1\}^N$. Suppose $\mathcal{A}_N$ is a sequence of finite sets such that $|\mathcal{A}_N| = O(N)$. For each N , suppose $(f_\alpha)_{\alpha \in \mathcal{A}_N}$ is a collection of functions from $\{-1, 1\}^N$ into $[-1, 1]$ and $(g_\alpha)_{\alpha \in \mathcal{A}_N}$ is a collection of i.i.d. standard Gaussian random variables. Fix a parameter γ . Let G_N be the probability measure on $\{-1, 1\}^N$ satisfying

$$G_N(\{\sigma\}) \propto \mu_N(\{\sigma\}) \exp\left(\gamma \sum_{\alpha \in \mathcal{A}_N} g_\alpha f_\alpha(\sigma)\right).$$

Let ψ_N be the free energy per particle in this model, that is,

$$(4) \quad \psi_N = \psi_N(\gamma) := \frac{1}{N} \log \sum_{\sigma} \mu_N(\sigma) \exp\left(\gamma \sum_{\alpha \in \mathcal{A}_N} g_\alpha f_\alpha(\sigma)\right).$$

Let $p_N = \mathbb{E}(\psi_N)$. Assume that $p(\gamma) := \lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} p_N(\gamma)$ exists.

Next, for two replicas σ^1 and σ^2 , define the generalized overlap as

$$R_{1,2} := \frac{1}{N} \sum_{\alpha \in \mathcal{A}_N} f_\alpha(\sigma^1) f_\alpha(\sigma^2).$$

Assume that $R_{1,1}$ is a deterministic constant for all σ^1 . Given n and a bounded measurable function $f : \mathbb{R}^{n(n-1)/2} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$, let $\delta_N(\gamma)$ be defined as in (1), in terms of the generalized overlaps defined above.

Theorem 1.2. *Suppose p is differentiable at a point γ . Then the Ghirlanda-Guerra identities hold at this γ , that is, $\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \delta_N(\gamma) = 0$.*

Note that this result includes the Sherrington-Kirkpatrick model and Derrida's p -spin models under a random external field. It also covers lattice models like the random field Ising model and the Edwards-Anderson model [6]. For example, in the Edwards-Anderson model, the spins are located on a subset of the d -dimensional integer lattice; $\mathcal{A}_N$ is the set of edges in this subset, and for an edge $\alpha = (i, j) \in \mathcal{A}_N$, $f_\alpha(\boldsymbol{\sigma}) = \sigma_i \sigma_j$. The measure μ_N is just the uniform distribution on $\{-1, 1\}^N$ in this case. In this model, our generalized overlap is simply what's known as the bond overlap, and γ is the inverse temperature parameter. Here we do not need to apply a random external field. The existence of the limit of the free energy per particle in the lattice models follow from simple arguments, e.g. those in [10], Chapter 2.

2. PROOF

We will only prove Theorem 1.2, since Theorem 1.1 is a special case of Theorem 1.2. Let

$$H = H(N) := \frac{\sum g_\alpha f_\alpha(\boldsymbol{\sigma})}{N}.$$

It is easy to prove via integration by parts (see e.g. [12], Section 2.12) that the Ghirlanda-Guerra identities hold if

$$(5) \quad \lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \nu(|H - \nu(H)|) = 0.$$

We prove (5) in two steps. First, we show that

$$(6) \quad \lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{E}|\langle H \rangle - \nu(H)| = 0.$$

This part requires no new ideas. The proof goes as follows. Note that

$$(7) \quad \langle H \rangle = \psi'_N(\gamma) \quad \text{and} \quad \nu(H) = p'_N(\gamma).$$

Fix some $\gamma' > \gamma$. By the convexity of ψ_N and (7), we have

$$(8) \quad \langle H \rangle \leq \frac{\psi_N(\gamma') - \psi_N(\gamma)}{\gamma' - \gamma}.$$

Again, by standard concentration of measure (see e.g. [12], Theorem 2.2.4) we know that for any γ ,

$$(9) \quad \mathbb{E}|\psi_N(\gamma) - p_N(\gamma)| \leq \sqrt{\text{Var}(\psi_N(\gamma))} \leq C|\gamma| \sqrt{\frac{|\mathcal{A}_N|}{N^2}},$$

where C is a universal constant. Thus,

$$\begin{aligned} & \mathbb{E} \left| \frac{\psi_N(\gamma') - \psi_N(\gamma)}{\gamma' - \gamma} - p'(\gamma) \right| \\ & \leq \frac{C(|\gamma| + |\gamma'|)}{\gamma' - \gamma} \sqrt{\frac{|\mathcal{A}_N|}{N^2}} + \frac{|p_N(\gamma') - p(\gamma')| + |p_N(\gamma) - p(\gamma)|}{\gamma' - \gamma} \\ & \quad + \left| \frac{p(\gamma') - p(\gamma)}{\gamma' - \gamma} - p'(\gamma) \right|. \end{aligned}$$

Since $|\mathcal{A}_N| = O(N)$ and $p_N \rightarrow p$ pointwise, we get

$$\limsup_{N \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{E} \left| \frac{\psi_N(\gamma') - \psi_N(\gamma)}{\gamma' - \gamma} - p'(\gamma) \right| \leq \left| \frac{p(\gamma') - p(\gamma)}{\gamma' - \gamma} - p'(\gamma) \right|.$$

Combining with (8), we see that

$$\limsup_{N \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{E}(\langle H \rangle - p'(\gamma))_+ \leq \left| \frac{p(\gamma') - p(\gamma)}{\gamma' - \gamma} - p'(\gamma) \right|.$$

Here x_+ denotes the positive part of a real number x . Since this bound holds for any $\gamma' > \gamma$ and p is differentiable at γ , we get

$$\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{E}(\langle H \rangle - p'(\gamma))_+ = 0.$$

Similarly, considering $\gamma' < \gamma$ and repeating the steps, we can show that the limit of the negative part is zero as well. Thus,

$$\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{E}|\langle H \rangle - p'(\gamma)| = 0.$$

By Jensen's inequality, this gives

$$\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} |\nu(H) - p'(\gamma)| = 0.$$

Combining the last two identities, we get (6). This completes the first step. In the next part of the proof, we show that

$$(10) \quad \lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \nu(|H - \langle H \rangle|) = 0.$$

Combined with (6), this will complete the proof of (5) and hence the theorem. To show (10), it suffice to prove that

$$(11) \quad \lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{E}(\langle H - \langle H \rangle \rangle^2) = 0.$$

The key new idea at this stage is the use of the following result. Essentially, this is the Parseval identity for the L^2 norm of a Gaussian functional expressed as a sum of squares of its Fourier coefficients in the orthogonal basis of multidimensional Hermite polynomials.

Theorem 2.1 ([4]). *Let $\mathbf{g} = (g_1, \dots, g_n)$ be a vector of i.i.d. standard Gaussian random variables, and let f be a C^∞ function of $\mathbf{g}$ with bounded derivatives of all orders. Then*

$$\text{Var}(f) = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{k!} \sum_{1 \leq i_1, \dots, i_k \leq n} \left(\mathbb{E} \left(\frac{\partial^k f}{\partial g_{i_1} \cdots \partial g_{i_k}} \right) \right)^2.$$

The convergence of the infinite series is part of the conclusion.

The formula in its above form is stated and proved in [4]. Different versions of the identity were observed by a number of authors; let us refer to Section 3.8 of [4] for a discussion of these observations and alternate proofs.

We will now prove (11) using the above theorem. In the following, we will simply write f_α instead of $f_\alpha(\boldsymbol{\sigma})$. Integration by parts gives

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E} \langle (H - \langle H \rangle)^2 \rangle &= \mathbb{E} \langle H^2 \rangle - \mathbb{E} \langle H \rangle^2 \\ &= \frac{1}{N^2} \sum_{\alpha, \alpha'} \mathbb{E} (g_\alpha g_{\alpha'} (\langle f_\alpha f_{\alpha'} \rangle - \langle f_\alpha \rangle \langle f_{\alpha'} \rangle)) \\ &= \frac{1}{N^2} \sum_{\alpha, \alpha'} \mathbb{E} \left(\frac{\partial^2}{\partial g_\alpha \partial g_{\alpha'}} (\langle f_\alpha f_{\alpha'} \rangle - \langle f_\alpha \rangle \langle f_{\alpha'} \rangle) \right) \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{N^2} \sum_{\alpha} \mathbb{E} (\langle f_\alpha^2 \rangle - \langle f_\alpha \rangle^2). \end{aligned}$$

Now note that

$$\frac{1}{N} (\langle f_\alpha f_{\alpha'} \rangle - \langle f_\alpha \rangle \langle f_{\alpha'} \rangle) = \frac{1}{\gamma^2} \frac{\partial^2 \psi_N}{\partial g_\alpha \partial g_{\alpha'}},$$

where ψ_N is the free energy per particle defined in (4). Thus, by the Cauchy-Schwarz inequality and Theorem 2.1, we get

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E} \langle (H - \langle H \rangle)^2 \rangle &\leq \frac{1}{N\gamma^2} \sum_{\alpha, \alpha'} \mathbb{E} \left(\frac{\partial^4 \psi_N}{\partial g_\alpha^2 \partial g_{\alpha'}^2} \right) + \frac{2|\mathcal{A}_N|}{N^2} \\ &\leq \frac{|\mathcal{A}_N|}{N\gamma^2} \left(\sum_{\alpha, \alpha'} \left(\mathbb{E} \left(\frac{\partial^4 \psi_N}{\partial g_\alpha^2 \partial g_{\alpha'}^2} \right) \right)^2 \right)^{1/2} + O(1/N) \\ &\leq \frac{|\mathcal{A}_N| \sqrt{4! \text{Var}(\psi_N)}}{N\gamma^2} + O(1/N). \end{aligned}$$

The proof is now completed by applying the variance inequality (9).

Acknowledgments. The authors thanks Michel Talagrand and Pierluigi Contucci for helpful comments.

REFERENCES

- [1] AIZENMAN, M. and CONTUCCI, P. (1998). On the stability of the quenched state in mean-field spin-glass models. *J. Stat. Phys.*, **92** nos. 5/6, 765–783.

- [2] ARGUIN, L.-P. (2008). Competing particle systems and the Ghirlanda-Guerra identities. *Electron. J. Probab.* **13** no. 69, 2101–2117.
- [3] ARGUIN, L.-P. and AIZENMAN, M. (2009). On the structure of quasi-stationary competing particle systems. *Ann. Probab.* **37** no. 3, 1080–1113.
- [4] CHATTERJEE, S. (2009). Disorder chaos and multiple valleys in spin glasses. *Preprint*. Available at <http://arxiv.org/abs/0907.3381>
- [5] CONTUCCI, P. and GIARDINÀ, C. (2007). The Ghirlanda-Guerra identities. *J. Stat. Phys.* **126** no. 4-5, 917–931.
- [6] EDWARDS, S. F. and ANDERSON, P. W. (1975). Theory of spin glasses. *J. Phys. F*, **5** 965–974.
- [7] GHIRLANDA, S. and GUERRA, F. (1998). General properties of overlap probability distributions in disordered spin systems. Towards Parisi ultrametricity. *J. Phys. A* **31** no. 46, 9149–9155.
- [8] GUERRA, F. and TONINELLI, F. L. (2002). The thermodynamic limit in mean field spin glass models. *Comm. Math. Phys.* **230** no. 1, 71–79.
- [9] PANCHENKO, D. (2009). A connection between Ghirlanda-Guerra identities and ultrametricity. *Preprint*. Available at <http://arxiv.org/abs/0810.0743>
- [10] RUELLE, D. (1999). *Statistical mechanics. Rigorous results*. Reprint of the 1989 edition. World Scientific Publishing Co., Inc., NJ.
- [11] SHERRINGTON, D. and KIRKPATRICK, S. (1975). Solvable model of a spin glass. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **35** 1792–1796.
- [12] TALAGRAND, M. (2003). *Spin glasses: a challenge for mathematicians. Cavity and mean field models*. Springer-Verlag, Berlin.
- [13] TALAGRAND, M. (2009). Construction of pure states in mean field models for spin glasses. *Preprint*.

COURANT INSTITUTE OF MATHEMATICAL SCIENCES, NEW YORK UNIVERSITY, 251
MERCER STREET, NEW YORK, NY 10012